

Academic Leadership Experience Program: The Art and Science of Giving Effective Feedback

Sponsored by the
Office of the Vice Provost for
Faculty Affairs

January 14, 2026



University
of Vermont



Your Facilitators



Gilpatrick Hornsby

Associate Vice Provost, Faculty Success
James Madison University



Sarah Seigle Peatman

Director of Partner Development
Academic Impressions

When was the last time you received really effective feedback?

- What made it so good?
- How did you feel?

Now think about a recent example of a time when you gave feedback to someone else.

- What went well?
- What could have gone better?

Feedback is your first line of defense

Feedback may be tricky or awkward to give, but it is the **FIRST LINE OF DEFENSE** in staving off what can become much larger, more overblown, and more difficult situations in the future.

- Offer feedback **early and often**.

Other things to consider

- Beware imposing your own stories and assumptions on the situation
- Ask yourself: What is my motivation for giving this feedback?
- Power dynamics feature prominently
- We focus a lot on giving constructive feedback, but it's also important to:
 - Celebrate small moments
 - Solicit feedback from your constituents



The secret to giving great feedback

2,830,295 views | LeeAnn Renninger | The Way We Work • January 2020



Questions or
Reactions?



Example 1

Do you have a minute for me to share some feedback with you?

I noticed that you have not attended the last 2 faculty meetings. There is an expectation that we will all attend faculty meetings, and your absence could be interpreted as disinterest in the department's collective work, or lack of commitment to department leadership and service. Is there something going on that is preventing you from attending, or is there another reason that you have chosen not to attend?

Example 1

1. Micro-yes:

Do you have a minute for me to share some feedback with you?

2. Data point - specific objective feedback:

I noticed that you have not attended the last 2 faculty meetings.

3. Show impact:

There is an expectation that we will all attend faculty meetings, and your absence could be interpreted as disinterest in the department's collective work, or lack of commitment to department leadership and service.

4. End with a question:

Is there something going on that is preventing you from attending, or is there another reason that you have chosen not to attend?

Example 2

Great presentation—can I share more about what I mean by that?

It was informative (I learned things), engaging (I had opportunities to think and contribute) and meaningful (it helped our group think about important efforts we could possibly make towards graduation rates). I really hope that more of our meetings are like this, so it was also excellent role modeling for the rest of us. How did you feel about your presentation?

Example 2

1. Micro-yes:

Great presentation—can I share more about what I mean by that?

2. Data point - specific objective feedback:

It was informative (I learned things), engaging (I had opportunities to think and contribute) and meaningful (it helped our group think about important efforts we could possibly make towards graduation rates).

3. Show impact:

I really hope that more of our meetings are like this, so it was also excellent role modeling for the rest of us.

4. End with a question:

How did you feel about your presentation?

Example 3

I have some feedback for you - is now a good time or should we schedule a meeting?

On 3 separate occasions in the last 3 weeks, I have asked you to update the webpage with the meeting dates, but it has not yet been done. I am concerned that we are opening an application for a program without the necessary information available to applicants. Is there something I should do differently when I make these requests? And what should I do if I'm not getting your attention and I'm feeling frustrated?

Example 3

1. Micro-yes:

I have some feedback for you – is now a good time or should we schedule a meeting?

2. Data point - specific objective feedback:

On 3 separate occasions in the last 3 weeks, I have asked you to update the webpage with the meeting dates, but it has not yet been done.

3. Show impact:

I am concerned that we are opening an application for a program without the necessary information available to applicants.

4. End with a question:

Is there something I should do differently when I make these requests? And what should I do if I'm not getting your attention and I'm feeling frustrated?

Let's practice...

ON YOUR OWN:

- Think about a piece of feedback you have to give someone (or that you recently gave)
- Using Worksheet 1 in the chat, write a brief script for how you would provide this feedback using the four-step model.

Partner role play: Round One

15 MINUTES IN TRIADS (5 MINS PER PERSON):

- Person 1: Person giving the feedback
- Person 2: Person receiving the feedback
- Person 3: Observer; provide feedback to Person 1

Group debrief

- How did it go?
- Was the communication clear?
- Was the script helpful?

Practice Round Two: Group Discussion

AS A WHOLE GROUP:

- Read the scenario on Worksheet 2
- 5 minutes to write your scripts silently
- Hear and debrief together

Commitment to action

Think about one piece of feedback you need to give—and maybe have been avoiding giving. From everything you've learned today, what is one thing you can commit to trying or implementing that is both **meaningful** and **manageable**?



Thank you!

sarah@academicimpressions.com

hornsgd@jmu.edu





University of Vermont Academic Leadership Experience Program Worksheet 1

1. Think about a piece of feedback you have to give someone (or that you recently gave). Using this example, write out a very short script using the following steps from the TEDTalk, *The Secret to Giving Great Feedback*.

i. **Micro-yes:** Lets them know feedback is coming, and gives sense of autonomy through the option to say yes or no.

ii. **Data point:** What did you see, hear or observe, without blur words; be specific.

iii. **Show impact:** How did it impact you or others?

iv. **End on a question:** Creates commitment rather than just compliance; moves feedback from a monologue to a joint problem-solving situation.