

Jennings, Karen L., Bierman, Paul R. and Southon, John, 2002, **Timing and style of deposition on humid-temperate fans, Vermont, U.S.A.**, For submission after revision to the GSA Bulletin.

Overall, this paper seems to be in good shape. Virtually all suggestions made by the three reviewers were addressed in the revised version. Most of my comments are detailed oriented and have been divided into two categories: *Figures and discussion*. Considering that one of your major conclusions pertains to the dramatically increased rate of sedimentation caused presumably by anthropogenic vegetation removal during historic time, do you want to hint at that in your title?

FIGURES:

The improvements made to figures 4-8 are great. Figure 4, the Eden Mills fan, has several typos that should be cleaned up. (refer to scratched-upon printout). One issue that applies to all five figures regards the scaling of the depth columns for each fan. Are the holes drawn to scale? On page 6, you state "...we had the backhoe dig one to three meters deeper at one location within each trench in order to determine the stratigraphy of the lower fan and underlying units." The depth divisions in the figures do not extend below the overall trench level. I assume that they are to scale, but it would be easy to add ticks for clarification.

DISCUSSION:

I found the discussion section to be clearly organized. Issues were overall addressed. I picked up several grammatical errors.

- Last paragraph of pg. 21- first sentence. "fan data...over the Holocene; we find *that* such..." Add 'that' even better reword into two sentences.
- First paragraph of *Timing of fan deposition and soil formation*. "Despite...units *is* indicative..."
- First paragraph of *Comparison to other paleostorminess records*. "our estimates..., considering the uncertainty in dating." This is a bit awkward; I am not quite sure exactly what you are getting at.
- First paragraph of *Utility of fans as recorders of hillslope erosion and paleostorminess*. Last sentence, "However...,estimate minimum basin sediment yields..."