

Paul Melillo

Critical Review of Geologic Writing

Geology 371

Review of: "Revisiting the age of the Black hawk: Landslide dating using ^{10}Be and ^{26}Al
by Kyle Nichols

The paper in review is about a study conducted studying the age of the Black hawk landslide located in the Mojave Desert, California. The landslide has had several attempts to be dated in the past but; the results have been provided inaccurate information. Two previous studies have data the landslides to be between 10,000 and 55,000 y.b.p. and the second results are 17,400 y.b.p. These results provide information that isn't sufficient to accurately date the landslide. This paper presents research about the age of the landslide using geomorphic modeling to the date the Black hawk landslide at approximately 30,000 to 35,000 y.b.p.

This paper was very well written and contained a large amount of information on how the study was conducted. The quality of the data in this paper is good. The methods in the paper have some good parts that are informative to the reader. The part of the paper that talks about the laboratory analysis I felt could be a little to much technology for what this journey is looking for, maybe hard for the layman to read and understand. The interpretations in the paper were present with supporting evidence and flowed nicely thought the paper. Both the writing and illustrations were present in a clear and concise way, with the illustrations incorporated well to support the writing.

I recommended this paper for submission to California Geology, after a few corrections are made. The conclusion section needs to be written. I feel that the end of the implications could be expanded and that the ending could be more conclusive.

1. The idea of maximum of ridge crest erosion and side slope deposition presents is hard to follow, more detail needs to be given in regard to how this is done.

2. This part of the paper is very techie and I think that this isn't what California Geology is looking for.
3. A good conclusion needs to be added to the paper to wrap it all up.