

Paul Melillo

Critical Review of Geologic Writing

Geology 371

Review of: "Assessment of Urban Streams in Fairmount Park, Philadelphia, PA by  
Christina Cianfrani

The paper in review is about a study that developed a method to assess streams based on geomorphic, habitat and riparian features. The study area contained 60 km of streams and had 426 reaches. The data was interpreted using a stream quality index (SQI) which classified the streams into four major categories: several impaired, impaired, moderately impaired, and slightly or non-impaired. A method such as the SQI will allow stream reaches to be compared worldwide which has a number of benefits in environmental planning and environmental assessment.

This paper was very well written and contained a large amount of information on how the study was conducted. The quality of the data in this paper is good. The methods were very good and informative to the reader. In the reading the methods had several points where you mix the methods with other information other than the methods. The interpretations in the paper were present with supporting evidence and flowed nicely through the paper. Both the writing and illustrations were present in a clear and concise way, with the illustrations incorporated well to support the writing.

I recommended this paper for submission to Journal of the American Water Resources Association, after a few corrections are made. The conclusion section needs to be re-written at the end.

1. You should make the link in this paper to its use outside of the study area, because I feel that the link is there and that it can be easily made.
2. Another point at which the link to outside of the study is can be made.

3. You introduce macroinvertebrates at this point but don't really give a good background on why you are using this in your study.
4. The end of this paper kind of leaves me hanging. I would like to see an ending sentence wrapping up the study and suggesting that studies like these are good measures to implement recommendations in streams worldwide.