

Critical Reviews of Geologic Writing  
Geology 371  
Paul Melillo  
2/6/02

Paper: **Spatial Pattern of Erosion in the Great Smoky Mountains, North Carolina and Tennessee: Implication on Steady State Mountain Belts**

Author: Air Matmon

This paper addresses the spatial pattern of erosion in the Great Smoky Mountains in North Carolina and Tennessee. This paper has several results that indicate rapid alluvial transport. The estimates of sediment generations and erosion rates are the first of its kind. The results gathered from this study confirm some of the basic ideas embedded in the geographic cycle model of Dave and dynamic equilibrium model of Hack.

I feel that the quality of the paper is very high and the content of the paper is very clear and concise. The logic of interpretations is clear to me but it may not be from other that has less experience with these types of studies. The paper is very well written and but I feel that some attention should be given to keep the reader interesting in the paper and to lead the reader into the next section. The clarity of the writing was very well done, getting across to the reader the points intended and support the paper's points very nicely. The figures were used very supportively and add to the paper as a whole. I am still missing the idea of what the big picture is for this paper, I feel that you need to state clearly that this is a new find that has never been found.

I would recommend this paper to the American Journal of Science granted the some small corrections are made. I am recommending it to the American Journal of Science because it does address the follow:

“Papers submitted will be judged from the standpoint of scientific originality and subject matter. Only papers that have not been previously published can be accepted. Cover letters must state that the paper is new and original and not under consideration for publication elsewhere. Papers pending in other journals will not be considered. Co-authors should be individuals who have contributed substantially to the content of the paper.”

Upon completion of a few format things asked by nature and a very small amount of structure issue I feel that this paper is ready to go.

1. Remove the web page address its very awkward to read along and see the whole web page address, instead put something like NPS web page.
2. Why are these bold, you have done this several times in the paper? If these studies are import then state that instead of making them bold.