

Exclusive New Benefit for AAAS Members





AAAS Policy Alert

Science

Magazine

News

Signaling

Careers

Multimedia

Collections

[Current Issue](#)
[Previous Issues](#)
[Science Express](#)
[Science Products](#)
[My Science](#)
[About the Journal](#)
[Home](#) > [Science Magazine](#) > [26 September 1997](#) >

[Aalto et al. , pp. 1909 – 1914](#)

Science 26 September 1997:
 Vol. 277, no. 5334, pp. 1909 – 1914
 DOI: 10.1126/science.277.5334.1909c

LETTERS

A HILL OF BEANS
 LETTERS FROM:
[Rolf Aalto , et al.](#)

[Alexander L. Densmore, et al.](#)

Alexander L. Densmore *et al.* (Reports, [17 Jan., p. 369](#)) address an important geomorphologic question: What is the relative importance of large, infrequent, slope-clearing events (SCEs) in determining hillslope longitudinal profiles? To model the frequency and magnitude distribution of SCEs, they filled a narrow [2.5-centimeter (cm)] flume with red beans, slowly lowered an outlet on one end to simulate an incising river, and recorded the resulting mass flux from their simulated hillslope with each 0.5-cm drop in base level. While occurring only 10% of the time, SCEs in their flume accounted for 70% of the total mass removed from the landscape. Between individual SCEs, smaller events developed steep "inner gorges" that were eventually cleared by the next SCE, which suggests that similar features in natural landscapes reflect SCE frequency, not changes in river incision rate as typically assumed.

We were intrigued by the results from this simulation of hillslope failure and recreated the bean model in a graduate seminar. Initial results suggested that flume width controlled the frequency and mechanics of failure, so we built a larger model with adjustable dimensions ([1](#)) to further measure the effects of different boundary conditions. As flume width increased, SCEs occurred more frequently (Table [1](#)), "inner gorges" vanished, slopes smoothed, and gradient decreased. Unexpectedly, frequency-magnitude changes balanced such that average SCE mass remained roughly constant up to a 10-cm width. Our additional experiments demonstrated that flume width (relative to grain diameter) is a first-order control on failure form, frequency, and magnitude ([2](#)). Our results confirm previous work ([3](#)) which showed that the effects of increasing boundary width diminish above six-grain diameters (approximately 10 cm). Boundary conditions, granular interaction, and packing control failure mechanics of granular materials ([4](#)); particle wedging, bridging, and brick-like stacking one-dimensional to two-all constrained failure in our flume at narrow widths. Boundary effects aside, as grain slopes widened from 1-dimensional to 2-dimensional, lateral noise propagation reduced the self-organized critical slope by amplifying chain reactions ([5](#)). The physical behavior on which Densmore *et al.* based the geomorphic relevance of their experiments vanished upon widening of the flume in our experiments. Because landslides are generally wide ([6](#)), the

ADVERTISEMENT

Submit your paper today

CLICK HERE



[To Advertise](#) [Find Products](#)

ADVERTISEMENT

FEATURED JOBS

[AQUATIC BIOGEOCHEMIST](#)

University of Montana
 Montana

[Institute for Diabetes, Obesity and Metabolism/Department of Radiology](#)

University of Pennsylvania
 Pennsylvania

[Appointment of Executive Director](#)

National University of Singapore
 Singapore

[Director](#)

University of Wyoming
 Laramie, WY

[POSTDOCTORAL POSITION](#)

University of Pittsburgh
 Cancer Institute
 Pittsburgh, PA

[Research Specialist](#)

Johns Hopkins University
 School of Medicine
 Baltimore, MD

[Research Associate](#)

Manchester Metropolitan University
 Manchester, United Kingdom

[More jobs](#)

extrapolation made by Densmore *et al.* from the behavior of a hill of beans to bedrock hillslope evolution appears to be unwarranted.

Table 1. Experimental variables and results of hillslope failure modeled with red beans.

Width (cm)	Flume width/ bean length	SCEs (%)	Slope (deg)	SCE mass (g) (average)	SCE mass (%)
2.5	1.4	11	37.1 ± 1.7	260 ± 96	66
5	2.9	30	33.7 ± 1.1	213 ± 93	76
10	5.8	49	31.8 ± 0.8	264 ± 135	81
15	8.6	50	32.2 ± 0.5	348 ± 131	78

Rolf Aalto
 David R. Montgomery
 Bernard Hallet
 Timothy B. Abbe
 John M. Buffington
 Kurt M. Cuffey
 Kevin M. Schmidt

Department of Geological Sciences,
 University of Washington,
 Seattle, WA 98195–1310, USA

REFERENCES AND NOTES

1. Our steel-framed plexiglass flume measures 38 (length) × 85 cm (high) and adjusts to be up to 25 cm wide. For each width, results were calculated from approximately 200 boundary drops. Red beans averaged 1.74 × 0.80 × 0.51 cm, and our analysis followed that in the report by Densmore *et al.*
2. For narrow widths, flume length and depth also appeared to have had an effect, albeit minor.
3. A. van Burkalow, *Geol. Soc. Am. Bull.* **56**, 669 (1945) [[Abstract](#)]. At larger widths, our red beans exhibited behavior similar to the smooth slopes reported for white beans in the report by Densmore *et al.*; thus, differences in bean size, not anisotropy, may account for the two modes of behavior reported by Densmore *et al.* for the 2.5-cm flume (1).
4. H. M. Jaeger, S. R. Nagel, R. P. Behringer, *Phys. Today* **50**, 32 (April 1996); Y. Onda and Y. Matsukura, *Earth Surf. Process. Landforms* **22**, 401 (1997).
5. P. Bak *et al.*, *Phys. Rev. A* **38**, 364 (1988) [[CrossRef](#)] [[Medline](#)].
6. N. Hovius, C. P. Stark, and P. A. Allen [*Geology* **25**, 231 (1997)] found the mean plan form of Southern New Zealand Alps landslides to be approximately elliptical, with an aspect ratio of about 2.0 across all length scales.

Response: Aalto *et al.* properly draw attention to the potential role played by laterally confining stresses in the behavior of dry red beans in response to a falling base level. There are several reasons, however, why their rejection of our interpretations may be premature. The statistics of slides in anisotropic dry beans, in contrast to those in almost-spherical white beans, are similar to the albeit few observational data about landslides (1). As in our report, we attribute this behavior to the supporting shear stresses induced by the shape anisotropy of the red beans and draw attention again to experiments with rice (2), which showed behavior fundamentally different from that of almost-spherical sand grains. While such statistical agreement is not by itself conclusive, it suggests that real hillslopes are more analogous to those experiments with beans that include some form of supporting shear stresses imparting an integrity or coherence.

The origin of supporting shear stresses and confining normal stresses may be quite diverse and, as suggested by Aalto *et al.*, may arise from the confining walls of our relatively narrow experimental apparatus. By increasing the width of their apparatus, Aalto *et al.* decreased the effects of the walls, creating wide, planar model hillslopes. Real hillslopes are rarely planar, however, and supporting stresses may arise within a ridge and valley topography (3), in which the falling base level (for example, an incising river) meanders. Thus, we might expect ridge lines (or spurs) to be sites of relatively less confining normal stresses and hollows (or tributary valleys) to experience greater confining stresses. The degree and variability of channel sinuosity versus the material strength and cohesiveness will presumably influence the behavior of landslides over both space and time. It is also possible that there exist various length scales, even in planar hillslopes, at which failure of the hillslope occurs en masse or in discrete units, the latter yielding inner gorges, the former not. For example, mass wasting along the lee sides of sand dunes is organized into discrete grain flows, despite the planar nature of such slopes (4). We expect that bean experiments on a yet wider apparatus would show evidence of such organization. Supporting stresses may also occur in heterogeneous geology or in response to an externally imposed stress field that is still further complicated by fault activity in the upper few kilometers of the crust. Neither our simple model nor that of Aalto *et al.* is capable of addressing these more complex and interesting issues.

Finally, we reiterate that inner gorges are commonly observed features in many mountainous landscapes; they occur at various length scales and at various distances upstream from local base level. It is highly unlikely that the origins of all such inner gorges can be tied to global changes in base level, whether tectonically or climatically controlled. A simpler explanation is that the natural development of hillslopes involves the generation of inner gorges and intermediate scarps, as demonstrated in our experiments.

Alexander L. Densmore

Department of Geology,
Trinity College, Dublin 2, Ireland

Robert S. Anderson

Department of Earth Sciences,
University of California,
Santa Cruz, CA 95064, USA

Michael A. Ellis

Center for Earthquake Research and Information,
University of Memphis,
Memphis, TN 38152, USA

REFERENCES

1. T. A. Blodgett *et al.*, *Eos* **77**, S261 (1996) ; N. Hovius, C. P. Stark, P. A. Allen, *Geology* **25**, 231 (1997) [[Abstract/Free Full Text](#)].
2. V. Frette *et al.*, *Nature* **379**, 49 (1996) [[CrossRef](#)].
3. D. J. Miller and T. Dunne, *J. Geophys. Res.* **101**, 25523 (1996) [[CrossRef](#)].
4. R. R. McDonald and R. S. Anderson, *J. Sediment Res.* **66**, 642 (1996).

[How to Submit a Letter to the Editor](#)

Volume 277, Number 5334, Issue of 26 September 1997, pp. 1909–1914.

©1997 by The American Association for the Advancement of Science.

Science. ISSN 0036-8075 (print), 1095-9203 (online)

[Magazine](#) | [News](#) | [Signaling](#) | [Careers](#) | [Multimedia](#) | [Collections](#) | [Help](#) | [Site Map](#) | [RSS](#)

[Subscribe](#) | [Feedback](#) | [Privacy / Legal](#) | [About Us](#) | [Advertise With Us](#) | [Contact Us](#)

© 1997 American Association for the Advancement of Science. All Rights Reserved.

AAAS is a partner of [HINARI](#), [AGORA](#), [PatientInform](#), [CrossRef](#), and [COUNTER](#).